Case 3191

Pareiasaurus karpinskii Amalitzky, 1922 (currently Scutosaurus karpinskii; Reptilia, Pareiasauria): proposed conservation of the specific name

Michael S.Y. Lee

Department of Palaeontology, The South Australian Museum, North Terrace, Adelaide 5000, Australia (e-mail: lee.mike@saugov.sa.gov.au)

Abstract. The purpose of this application is to conserve the specific name and typification of the taxon currently known as *Scutosaurus karpinskii* (Amalitzky, 1922), an abundant fossil pareiasaurian reptile from the Russian Permian. The specific name *karpinskii* is threatened by the spelling variant *karpinskyi*, inadvertently published prematurely by Watson (1917) when the full description was delayed by war and the death of Amalitzky; if the name were attributed to the 1917 publication the name-bearing type would not be the skeleton designated as the holotype of *Pareiasaurus karpinskii* by Amalitzky (1922).

Keywords. Nomenclature; taxonomy; Reptilia; Pareiasauria; PAREIASAURIDAE; *Scutosaurus*; *Scutosaurus karpinskii*; Permian; Russia.

- 1. The first specimens of the Permian pareiasaurian reptile currently known as *Scutosaurus karpinskii* (Amalitzky, 1922) were excavated from North Dvina (near Kotlas, north European Russia) around the beginning of the 20th-century by the palaeontologist Vladimir P. Amalitzky (Buffetaut, 1987; Ochev & Surkov, 2000). Amalitzky was preparing a full description of the entire North Dvina fauna, including the pareiasaur, but this was interrupted by the First World War and his sudden death in 1918 (Woodward, 1918; Buffetaut, 1987).
- 2. While Amalitzky's full description was delayed, his friend and colleague D.M.S. Watson (1917, p. 10) published a figure of a scapulocoracoid, labelling it 'Pariasaurus Karpinskyi, Amalitz'. This drawing was based on a poor and extensively remodelled cast in the Natural History Museum, London, of a specimen (PIN 2005/1535) in the Palaeontological Institute of the Russian Academy of Sciences in Moscow. The full description of the species was only published (posthumously) five years later, when Amalitzky (1922, pp. 334–335) described the taxon as 'Pareiosaurus Karpinskii', with a diagnosis and designation of a holotype. The holotype was illustrated and showed a complete skeleton in the Palaeontological Institute. This was matched by myself (Lee, 2000) to specimen number PIN 2005/1532—a different individual from the specimen represented by Watson's cast.
- 3. Watson's brief description has priority over Amalitzky's fuller treatment, and if this were followed the specific name *karpinskyi* would have priority over *karpinskii* and the specimen (PIN 2005/1535) from which the London cast was made might be cited as the holotype, rather than the skeleton of a different animal (PIN 2005/1532). However, Watson's anatomical paper was clearly not intended to be a formal

description of a new taxon, since (a) he explicitly credits Amalitzky as the source of the name, listing it as 'Pariasaurus Karpinskyi, Amalitz', and (b) apart from the illustration of the cast of a single element, he did not explicitly nominate a holotype or present a diagnosis. Clearly, he intended his contribution to appear after Amalitzky's formal description, but this did not occur due to the delays discussed above.

- 4. Hartmann-Weinberg (1930, p. 59) recognised that this Russian species is phylogenetically and morphologically very distinct from the South African taxon *Pareiasaurus serridens* (the type species of *Pareiasaurus* Owen, 1876), and she therefore erected the new genus *Scutosaurus* for the former; she consistently misspelt the specific name as *karpinsky*. Earlier proposed new generic assignments are typographic errors. Amalitsky (1922) obviously misspelt *Pareiasaurus*, since he referred the Russian taxon and *Pareiasaurus serridens* to the genus '*Pareiosaurus*'. Watson's (1914a, b; 1917) assignation of the Russian form and other pareiasaurs to '*Pariasaurus*' represents a similar invalid misspelling of *Pareiasaurus*. Evidently neither Amalitzky nor Watson intended to erect a new genus for *karpinskii*; they merely placed it in the same genus as *Pareiasaurus serridens* but misspelt the generic name.
- 5. Since Boonstra (1934a, b) the Russian taxon has almost universally been referred to as *Scutosaurus karpinskii* (Amalitzky, 1922). All papers since then have used the generic name *Scutosaurus* rather than the typographic variants of *Pareiasaurus*; examples are Hartmann-Weinberg (1937), Efremov (1940a, b, c); Huene (1944), Bystrow (1957), Olson (1957), Ivachnenko (1987), Gao (1989), Lee (1993, 1997, 2000), and Modesto & Rybczynski (2000). In contrast to the works listed above, only Gregory (1946) used the name *karpinskyi* while Kuhn (1969) used both spellings of the specific name.
- 6. The International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature is accordingly asked:
 - (1) to use its plenary power to suppress the specific name *karpinskyi* Watson, 1917, as published in the binomen *Pariasaurus karpinskyi*, for the purposes of both the Principle of Priority and the Principle of Homonymy;
 - (2) to place on the Official List of Generic Names in Zoology the name *Scutosaurus* Hartmann-Weinberg, 1930 (gender: masculine), type species by monotypy *Pareiasaurus karpinskii* Amalitzky, 1822;
 - (3) to place on the Official List of Specific Names in Zoology the name *karpinskii* Amalitzky, 1922, as published in the binomen *Pareiosaurus karpinskii* (specific name of the type species of *Scutosaurus* Hartmann-Weinberg, 1930);
 - (4) to place on the Official Index of Rejected and Invalid Specific Names in Zoology the name *karpinskyi* Watson, 1917, as published in the binomen *Pariasaurus* [sic] *karpinskyi* and as suppressed in (1) above.

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to Mikhail Ivachnenko, Nick Kalandadze, Oleg Lebedev and Mikhail Shishkin for access to, and information about, the relevant specimens in the Palaeontological Institute of the Russian Academy of Sciences (Moscow); Jenny Clack, who supervised this research during my Ph.D.; Sandra Chapman for access to

specimens in The Natural History Museum, London; John Scanlon for comments on the manuscript; and the Association of Commonwealth Universities and the Australian Research Council for funding.

References

Amalitzky, V.P. 1922. Diagnoses of the new forms of vertebrates and plants from the Upper Permian on North Dvina. *Izvestiya Rossiiskoi Akademii Nauk*, (6)16: 329–340.

Boonstra, L.D. 1934a. Pareiasaurian studies, part 9. The cranial osteology. *Annals of the South African Museum*, **31**: 1–38.

Boonstra, L.D. 1934b. Pareiasaurian studies, part 10. The dermal armour. *Annals of the South African Museum*, **31**: 39–48.

Buffetaut, E. 1987. A short history of vertebrate palaeontology. 223 pp. Croom Helm, London. Bystrow, A.P. 1957. [The pareiasaur skull]. Trudy Paleontologicheskogo Instituta, Akademiia Nauk SSSR, 68: 3–18. [In Russian].

Efremov, J.A. 1940a. Kurze Übersicht über die Formen der Perm- und der Trias-Tetrapoden Fauna der USSR. Zentralblatt für Mineralogie, Geologie und Paläontologie, Abteilungen B, 1940: 372–383.

Efremov, J.A. 1940b. [Composition of the Northern Dvina fauna of Permian Amphibia and Reptilia from the excavations of V.P. Amalitzky]. *Doklady Akademii Nauk SSSR*, 27: 893–896. [In Russian].

Efremov, J.A. 1940c. [Preliminary description of the new Permian and Triassic Tetrapoda from USSR]. *Trudy Paleontologicheskogo Instituta, Akademiia Nauk SSSR*, **10**(2): 1–140. [In Russian].

Gao, K. 1989. Pareiasaurs from the Upper Permian of north China. *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, **26**: 1234–1240.

Gregory, W.K. 1946. Pareiasaurs versus placodonts as near ancestors to the turtles. *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History*, **86**: 276–323.

Hartmann-Weinberg, A. 1930. Zur Systematik der Nord-Duna-Pareiasauridae. *Paläontologische Zeitschrift*, **12**(1): 47–59.

Hartmann-Weinberg, A. 1937. Pareiasauriden als Leitfossilien. *Problemy Paleontologii*, 2/3: 649–712.

Huene, F. von. 1944.

aus dem Ruhuhu-Gebiet. Paläontologische Zeitschrift,

23C: 386–410.

Ivachnenko, M.F. 1987. [Permian parareptiles of the USSR]. *Trudy Paleontologicheskogo Instituta, Akademiia Nauk SSSR*, **223**: 1–160. [In Russian].

Kuhn, O. 1969. *Handbuch der Paläoherpetologie*. Teil 6: Cotylosauria. 89 pp. Gustav Fischer, Stuttgart.

Lee, M.S.Y. 1993. The origin of the turtle body plan: bridging a famous morphological gap. *Science*, **261**: 1616–1620.

Lee, M.S.Y. 1997. A taxonomic revision of pareiasaurs: implications for Permian terrestrial palaeoecology. *Modern Geology*, **21**: 231–298.

Lee, M.S.Y. 2000. The Russian pareiasaurs. Pp. 71–85 *in* Benton, M.J., Shishkin, M.A., Unwin, D.M. & Kurochkin, E.N. (Eds.), *The age of dinosaurs in Russia and Mongolia*. 696 pp. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Modesto, S.P. & Rybczynski, N. 2000. The amniote faunas of the Russian Permian: implications for Late Permian terrestrial vertebrate biogeography. Pp. 17–34 in Benton, M.J., Shishkin, M.A., Unwin, D.M. & Kurochkin, E.N. (Eds.), *The age of dinosaurs in Russia and Mongolia*. 696 pp. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Ochev, V.G. & Surkov, M.V. 2000. The history of excavation of Permo-Triassic vertebrates from Eastern Europe. Pp. 1–16 in Benton, M.J., Shishkin, M.A., Unwin, D.M. & Kurochkin, E.N. (Eds.), *The age of dinosaurs in Russia and Mongolia*. 696 pp. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Olson, E.C. 1957. Catalogue of localities of Permian and Triassic terrestrial vertebrates of the territories of the U.S.S.R. *Journal of Geology*, **65**: 196–226.

- Owen, R. 1876. Catalogue of the fossil Reptilia of South Africa. 88 pp. British Museum, London.
- Watson, D.M.S. 1914a. On the skull of a pariasaurian reptile, and on the relationships of that type. *Proceedings of the Zoological Society of London*, **1914**: 155–180.
- Watson, D.M.S. 1914b. On the nomenclature of pariasaurs. *Annals and Magazine of Natural History*, (8)14: 98–102.
- Watson, D.M.S. 1917. The evolution of the tetrapod shoulder girdle and fore-limb. *Journal of Anatomy*, **52** (3rd series, vol. 13): 1–63.
- **Woodward, A.S.** 1918. Vladimir Prochorovich Amalitsky. Obituary. *Geological Magazine*, 5: 431–432.

Comments on this case are invited for publication (subject to editing) in the *Bulletin*; they should be sent to the Executive Secretary, I.C.Z.N., c/o The Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London SW7 5BD, U.K. (e-mail: iczn@nhm.ac.uk).